



# **FAMILY LAW**

## **Cases and Materials**

### **Volume I**

**Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**1996 - 1997**

**Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair, Ella Schwartz,  
Faith Teo and Wendy Adams**

**\* \* \***

***These materials are distributed solely for classroom use  
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto***

71  
62  
22  
1

117 554

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY  
AUG 29 1996  
FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

**FAMILY LAW**

**Cases and Materials**

**Volume I**

**Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**1996 - 1997**

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair, Ella Schwartz,  
Faith Teo and Wendy Adams

\* \* \*

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use  
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

# FAMILY LAW

## Table of Contents

### Volume I

#### Page No.

## I. INTRODUCTION: THE FAMILY AND FAMILY LAW

### A. The Family: Definitions and Demographics

Excerpts from Statutes, International Documents, Cases and Other Sources.....	1
Barrett and McIntosh, <i>The Anti-Social Family</i> .....	4
Thorne, <i>Rethinking the Family: Some Feminist Questions</i> .....	5
La Novara, <i>A Portrait of Families in Canada</i> .....	7
Vanier Institute, <i>Profiling Canada's Families</i> .....	9
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Family alive and well, study finds" .....	9
<i>Toronto Star</i> , "'Typical' family has vanished, report says" .....	11
Baker, "Family Trends and Family Policies" .....	13
Drakich and Guberman, "Violence in the Family" .....	17
MacLeod, <i>Battered But Not Beaten</i> .....	21
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Family Violence is manifestation of male power in society: Wilson" .....	26

### B. Legal Regulation of the Family

<i>Balfour v. Balfour</i> .....	28
Olsen, "The Family and the Market" .....	29
Minow, "Beyond State Intervention in the Family" .....	36
Eekelaar, <i>Family Law and Social Policy</i> .....	39
Glendon, <i>Abortion and Divorce in Western Law</i> .....	45

## II. MARRIAGE AND NULLITY

### A. The Significance of Marriage

Blackstone, <i>Commentaries on the Laws of England</i> .....	47
Cobbett, <i>Advice to Young Men and (incidentally) to Young Women</i> .....	47
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Canadian marriage rates to into dive" .....	48
Barr, <i>Basic Facts on Families in Canada</i> .....	49
Vanier Institute, <i>Profiling Canada's Families</i> .....	49
Cox, "Alternative Families" .....	52



Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Bigamy</i> .....	52
<i>Hyde v. Hyde</i> .....	53
<i>Graham v. Graham</i> .....	53
Day, "The Charter and Family Law" .....	56
Note: The Significance of Marriage for Aboriginal Women .....	57
Glendon, "The New Marriage and the New Property" .....	58
<i>R. V. Duvivier</i> .....	68

## **B. Unmarried Cohabitation**

Note: Terminology .....	72
Institute of Law Research and Reform, <i>Survey of Adult Living</i> <i>Arrangements</i> , "Summary of reasons for cohabitating" .....	72
O'Donovan, "Legal Marriage - Who Needs It?" .....	73
Glendon, <i>The Transformation of Family Law</i> , "Informal Family Relations" .....	78
Note: The Legislative Treatment of Unmarried Couples .....	81
<i>Miron v. Trudel</i> .....	83
<i>Molodowich v. Penttinen</i> .....	88
<i>Stoikiewicz v. Filas</i> .....	93
<i>Le Labbe and McCullough</i> .....	95
Ontario Law Reform Commission, Report on the Rights and Responsibilities of Cohabitants Under the Family Law Act (1993) .....	96

## **C. Validity of Marriage**

### **(a) Overview**

Hahlo, "Nullity of Marriage in Canada" .....	99
McLeod, "Validity of Marriage" from <i>Introduction to Family Law</i> .....	100

### **(b) Monogamy**

Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Bigamy</i> .....	106
Note: Monogamy .....	107
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Scads of Spouses" .....	110
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Community practises polygamy" .....	110
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Polygamous spouses covered under B.C. family legislation, judge holds" .....	112
<i>New York Times</i> , "My Husband's Nine Wives" .....	113
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "France Moves to Stem Polygamy" .....	114
Note: Serial Monogamy .....	117

(c) **Capacity to Consummate**

<i>Gajamugan v. Gajamugan</i> .....	118
<i>Dashevsky v. Dashevsky</i> .....	120
<i>Norman v. Norman</i> .....	123

(d) **Opposite Sexes**

<i>B. V. A.</i> .....	125
<i>Layland v. Ontario</i> .....	132
<i>Adams and Sullivan v. Howerton</i> .....	138
Law, "Homosexuality and the Social Meaning of Gender" .....	139
Duclos, "An Argument for Legal Recognition of Same Sex Marriage" .....	139
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Denmark allows homosexual marriage" .....	142
Note: The "Registered Partnership" in Denmark.....	142
Note: Same-Sex Couples and Extended Definitions of "Spouse" .....	142
<i>Anderson v. Luoma</i> .....	142
Note: Challenges to Benefits Programmes .....	145
<i>Mossop v. Canada</i> .....	146
<i>Egan v. Canada</i> .....	152
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Idea of extending benefits revived by Justice Minister" .....	156
Ontario Law Reform Commission, Report on the Rights and Responsibilities of Cohabitants Under the Family Law Act (1993) .....	157
Bill 167 .....	162
<i>M. v. H.</i> (1996), 17 R.F.L. (4th) 365 (Ont. Gen. Div.).....	164

(e) **Age** ..... 167

<i>The Guardian Weekly</i> , "Romantic Dilemma for Child Bride" .....	167
---	-----

(f) **Consent** ..... 169**III DIVORCE****A. The Social Context of Divorce**

Barr, <i>Basic Facts on Families in Canada</i> .....	170
Payne, "The Dichotomy between Family Law and Family Crises on Marriage Breakdown .....	171
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Marital upheaval" .....	172

## B. Reform of Divorce Law

### (a) Movement to No-Fault Divorce

Hahlo, "The Changing Face of Marriage and Divorce" .....	174
Abella, "Opening Address" in Sloss, ed., <i>Family Law in Canada</i> .....	177
Bissett-Johnson and Day, <i>The New Divorce Act</i> .....	180
Dept. Of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i> , "Background and Evaluation Issues" .....	183
Dept. Of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i> , "Reducing the Adversarial Process" .....	187

### (b) Critiques of No-Fault Divorce

R.E.A.L. Women, "Easy Divorce?" .....	189
Amiel, "The Fault in No-Fault Divorce" .....	191
Weitzman, "Divorce and the Illusion of Equality" .....	192
Melli, "Constructing a Social Problem: The Post-Divorce Plight of Women and Children" .....	196
Note: Other Critiques of No-Fault Divorce .....	197

### (c) Grounds for Divorce

#### (i) Living Separate and Apart

<i>Rushton v. Rushton</i> .....	202
<i>Dupere v. Dupere</i> .....	202
Note: Relevance of Date of Separation for Property Division under the <i>Family Law Act</i> .....	205
Note: Divorce Reform in England and Wales .....	205

#### (ii) Adultery

Bissett-Johnson and Day, <i>The New Divorce Law</i> , "Definition of Adultery" .....	206
Glendon, <i>The Transformation of Family Law</i> .....	206
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Wisconsin woman to stand trial on rarely used adultery charge" .....	207
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , re Brazilian defence of honour .....	208
<i>Masterlerz v. Garland</i> .....	208
<i>Davenport v. Miller</i> .....	210
<i>Orford v. Orford</i> .....	214
<i>MacLennan v. MacLennan</i> .....	215



(iii) Cruelty

<i>Knoll v. Knoll</i> .....	219
<i>Austin v. Austin</i> .....	221
<i>Gilbert v. Gilbert</i> .....	222
<i>B.(Y.) v. B.(J.)</i> .....	226
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , “Putting the ‘fault’ back in no-fault divorce” .....	228
<i>Lawyer’s Weekly</i> , “Spousal misconduct returns to divorce?” .....	229
<i>Lawyer’s Weekly</i> , “Battered woman wins suit” .....	233
Note: Tort of Emotional Distress.....	233

(d) Bars to Proceedings(i) Condonation, Connivance, Collusion

Davies, <i>Family Law in Canada</i> , “Condonation” .....	237
<i>Guglielmo v. Mikhail</i> (Lawyer’s Weekly).....	239
Davies, <i>Family Law in Canada</i> , “Connivance” and “Collusion” .....	240

(ii) Inadequate Provision for Child Support.....(iii) Removal of Barriers to Religious Divorce

<i>Globe and Mail</i> , “Ties that continue to bind” .....	244
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , “Religious laws to be removed as bargaining chip’ in divorces” .....	246

**C. Institutional Reforms: Mediation**

Landau, “Mediation: An Option for Divorcing Families” .....	247
Woods, “Mediation: A Backlash to Women’s Progress on Family Law Issues” .....	253
Payne and Overend, “Divorce Mediation: An Overview of Process and Strategies” .....	255
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , “Even for battered wives mediation is endorsed as an option in divorce” .....	265

**IV. THE ECONOMICS OF MARRIAGE BREAKDOWN****A. The Economics of Marriage**

Vanier Institute, <i>Profiling Canada’s Families</i> .....	267
Statistics Canada, <i>Women in the Labour Force</i> .....	270

Moller Oken, <i>Justice, Gender and the Family</i> .....	272
Gunderson, <i>Women and Labour Market Poverty</i> .....	273

## **B. The Economic Consequences of Divorce**

Vanier Institute, <i>Profiling Canada's Families</i> .....	276
Rogerson, "Winning the Battle, Losing the War" .....	279
Weitzman, "The Economics of Divorce" .....	283
Dept. Of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i> .....	284
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Family law reform can't solve divorce poverty?" .....	287